

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
F-016-23-C	SUDI/near-SUDI/apparent life-threatening event; Neglect	DCBS issues; DCBS history; Coroner issues; Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home); Domestic Violence; Family violence; Impaired caregiver; Medical issues/management; Overwhelmed Caregiver; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe sleep (bed sharing); Law enforcement issues; Medical neglect		Neglect (impaired caregiver); Neglect (unsafe sleep)	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
F-023-23-C	Suicide (child); Ligature hanging	Criminal history (caregiver); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Cognitive disability (child); Mental health issues (child); Substance abuse (child)		No abuse or neglect	Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
F-026-23-C	Abusive head trauma; Neglect; Overdose/ingestion; Physical abuse; Sexual abuse/human trafficking	Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home); DCBS history; Domestic Violence; Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Medical neglect; Mental health issues (caregiver); Neglectful entrustment; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Substitute caregiver at time of event ; Unsafe access to deadly means; Bystander issues/opportunities; Coroner issues		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect (medical); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Abusive head trauma; Physical abuse; Sexual abuse; Torture	Potentially preventable
F-038-23-NC	Gunshot (suicide); Neglect; Suicide (child)	Coroner issues; Education/child care issues; Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Medically fragile child; Mental health issues (caregiver); Mental health issues (child); Statutory Issues; Unsafe access to deadly means; Cognitive disability (child)		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means	Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
F-046-23-NC	Abusive head trauma; Neglect; Physical abuse	Coroner issues; DCBS issues; Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Lack of family support system ; Language/cultural issues; Law enforcement issues; Overwhelmed Caregiver; Substance abuse (in home); Supervisional neglect; Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Medical issues/management; Other	Delay in sending/recieving JC-3.	Abusive head trauma; Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Physical abuse; Supervisory neglect	Potentially preventable
NF-014-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	Bystander issues/opportunities; Criminal history (in the home); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Environmental neglect; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Neglectful entrustment; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Substitute caregiver at time of event ; Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Law enforcement issues; Domestic Violence; Financial issues; Housing instability		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-037-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	Bystander issues/opportunities; Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Domestic Violence; Environmental neglect; Family violence; Financial issues; Impaired caregiver; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Medical issues/management; Overwhelmed Caregiver; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Medical neglect; Law enforcement issues; Mental health issues (caregiver); Other	Lack of transportation	Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect (impaired caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-043-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	Cognitive disability (child); Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Domestic Violence; Environmental neglect; Evidence of poor bonding; Financial issues; Judicial process issues; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Law enforcement issues; Medical issues/management; Medical neglect; Medically fragile child; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-044-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	Commonwealth/County Attorneys; Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Law enforcement issues; MAT involvement; Mental health issues (caregiver); Neglectful entrustment; Other; Statutory Issues; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Unsafe access to deadly means; Coroner issues	COVID -earlier case contacts and court hearings were conducted virtually due COVID restrictions	Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-046-23-C					
NF-047-23-C	Neglect	DCBS history; DCBS issues; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Language/cultural issues; Medical issues/management; Medical neglect; Medically fragile child; Mental health issues (child)		Neglect (medical)	Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-048-23-C	Overdose/ingestion; Neglect; Suicide (child)	DCBS history; Overwhelmed Caregiver; Education/child care issues; Domestic Violence; Criminal history (in the home); Lack of family support system ; DCBS issues; Mental health issues (child); Criminal history (caregiver); Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Medical neglect		Neglect (medical)	Potentially preventable
NF-050-23-NC	Abusive head trauma	Financial issues; Medical issues/management; Mental health issues (caregiver); Substitute caregiver at time of event		Abusive head trauma	Manner undetermined/fo ul play not ruled out
NF-054-23-C	Neglect	DCBS history; DCBS issues; Bystander issues/opportunities; Cognitive disability (caregiver); Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home); Domestic Violence; Education/child care issues; Evidence of poor bonding; Financial issues; Housing instability; MAT involvement; Medical issues/management; Medical neglect; Medically fragile child; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Statutory Issues; Other	Lack of transportation	Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect (medical)	Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-056-23-NC	Overdose/ingestion; Neglect	DCBS history; DCBS issues; Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home); Domestic Violence; Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Medical neglect; Mental health issues (caregiver); Neglectful entrustment; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Unsafe access to deadly means; Bystander issues/opportunities		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect (medical); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-060-23-C	Neglect	DCBS history; Mental health issues (caregiver); Mental health issues (child); Out of State CPS History; DCBS issues; Domestic Violence; Medically fragile child; Other	Tennessee court did not involve DCBS in a home evaluation	No abuse or neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-067-23-NC	Gunshot (accidental); Neglect; Physical abuse	Bystander issues/opportunities; Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home); Medical neglect; Overwhelmed Caregiver; Unsafe access to deadly means; Supervisional neglect; Financial issues; Mental health issues (caregiver); Environmental neglect; Medical issues/management		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect (medical); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Physical abuse; Supervisory neglect	Manner undetermined/fo ul play not ruled out

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-071-23-C	Neglect	Cognitive disability (child); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Education/child care issues; Financial issues; Medical issues/management; Medical neglect; Medically fragile child; Mental health issues (caregiver); Other; Out of State CPS History; Overwhelmed Caregiver	Nutritional neglect	Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect (medical)	Potentially preventable
NF-073-23-C	Neglect; Failure to thrive/malnutrition	DCBS history; DCBS issues; Criminal history (in the home); Criminal history (caregiver); Education/child care issues; Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Medical neglect; Medically fragile child; Overwhelmed Caregiver; Supervisional neglect		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Supervisory neglect; Neglect (medical)	Potentially preventable
NF-074-23-NC	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	Commonwealth/County Attorneys; Environmental neglect; In-Home Service Provider Issues; Judicial process issues; Overwhelmed Caregiver; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-076-23-C	Neglect; Other; Physical abuse; Overdose/ingestion	Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Education/child care issues; Financial issues; Housing instability; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Law enforcement issues; Mental health issues (caregiver); Other; Overwhelmed Caregiver; Neglectful entrustment; Medically fragile child	delay in scheduling CAC interview, and COVID restrictions in place in prior casework, unrealistic parenting expectations, and emotional abuse.	Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Other; Physical abuse; Neglect (medical)	Potentially preventable
NF-078-23-C	Abusive head trauma; Physical abuse	DCBS issues; Failure to thrive; DCBS history; Judicial process issues; Lack of regular child care; Law enforcement issues; Medically fragile child; Commonwealth/County Attorneys; Mental health issues (caregiver); Substitute caregiver at time of event		Abusive head trauma; Physical abuse	Manner undetermined/ fo ul play not ruled out
NF-079-23-NC	Neglect	Education/child care issues; Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Housing instability; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Medical neglect; Medically fragile child; Mental health issues (caregiver); Mental health issues (child); Serial relationships; Supervisional neglect		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect (medical); Supervisory neglect	Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-080-23-C	Drowning/near-drowning; Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	Bystander issues/opportunities; Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Financial issues; Impaired caregiver; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Mental health issues (caregiver); Law enforcement issues; Overwhelmed Caregiver; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Environmental neglect; Domestic Violence; Housing instability; MAT involvement; Neglectful entrustment		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect (impaired caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Manner undetermined/fo ul play not ruled out

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-085-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	DCBS history; DCBS issues; Environmental neglect; Lack of family support system ; Lack of regular child care; Overwhelmed Caregiver; Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Substitute caregiver at time of event ; Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Financial issues; Education/child care issues; Law enforcement issues; Substance abuse (in home); Statutory Issues; MAT involvement		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-086-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	DCBS history; DCBS issues; Environmental neglect; Cognitive disability (child); Commonwealth/County Attorneys; Education/child care issues; Judicial process issues; Medical neglect; Mental health issues (child); Overwhelmed Caregiver; Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Substance abuse (in home); Financial issues		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect (medical); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-092-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	DCBS history; DCBS issues; Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Medical issues/management; Mental health issues (caregiver); Other; Out of State CPS History; Overwhelmed Caregiver; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Unsafe access to deadly means	COVID issue - schools closed so records could not be obtained in prior report.	Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-095-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	Criminal history (in the home); Criminal history (caregiver); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Domestic Violence; Substance abuse (in home); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Financial issues; Environmental neglect		Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-096-23-NC	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	Substance abuse (in home); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Environmental neglect; Other; Substance abuse by caregiver (current)	Lack of transportation	Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-097-23-NC	Overdose/ingestion; Neglect	Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Unsafe access to deadly means		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-101-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	DCBS history; DCBS issues; Housing instability; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Mental health issues (caregiver); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Unsafe access to deadly means; Statutory Issues; Environmental neglect		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-105-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	DCBS history; Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Mental health issues (caregiver); Out of State CPS History; Overwhelmed Caregiver; Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Substance abuse (in home); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Other	Lack of transportation	Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-106-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Impaired caregiver; Law enforcement issues; Medically fragile child; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Unsafe access to deadly means; Medical neglect		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect (impaired caregiver); Neglect (medical); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-108-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	DCBS history; DCBS issues; Education/child care issues; Environmental neglect; Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Law enforcement issues; Substitute caregiver at time of event		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means	Manner undetermined/fo ul play not ruled out

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-110-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	DCBS history; DCBS issues; Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home); Environmental neglect; Family violence; Financial issues; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Cognitive disability (caregiver); Domestic Violence; Housing instability; Impaired caregiver		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-114-23-C	Neglect	DCBS history; DCBS issues; Mental health issues (child); Supervisional neglect; Education/child care issues; Medical neglect		Neglect (medical); Supervisory neglect	Potentially preventable
NF-116-23-C	Neglect; Physical abuse	DCBS history; DCBS issues; Domestic Violence; Education/child care issues; Medical neglect; Environmental neglect; Housing instability; Mental health issues (caregiver); Mental health issues (child); Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Medical issues/management; Other; Law enforcement issues	Emotional injury	Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect (medical); Physical abuse; Other	Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel

December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-117-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion; Suicide (child)	Cognitive disability (child); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Education/child care issues; Financial issues; Law enforcement issues; Medical neglect; Mental health issues (child); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home)		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect (medical); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Potentially preventable
NF-118-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	DCBS history; DCBS issues; Commonwealth/County Attorneys; Financial issues; Criminal history (in the home); Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Mental health issues (caregiver); Substance abuse (in home); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Environmental neglect; Judicial process issues; Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Criminal history (caregiver); MAT involvement; Neglectful entrustment		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel
December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-121-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	DCBS issues; Criminal history (caregiver); Criminal history (in the home); DCBS history; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Mental health issues (caregiver); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Environmental neglect; Financial issues		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-127-23-NC	Overdose/ingestion; Neglect	DCBS issues; Environmental neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means; Medical issues/management		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-130-23-C	Overdose/ingestion; Neglect	Criminal history (caregiver); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Housing instability; MAT involvement; Substance abuse (in home); Substance abuse by caregiver (current); Unsafe access to deadly means; Criminal history (in the home); Medically fragile child; Serial relationships; Supervisional neglect; Lack of family support system ; Law enforcement issues		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable

Child Fatality and Near Fatality External Review Panel

December 17, 2024

Case Number	Categorization	Family Characteristics	Family Characteristics Comments	Panel Determination	Other Qualifiers
NF-133-23-NC	Abusive head trauma; Physical abuse	DCBS issues; Judicial process issues; Lack of regular child care; Substitute caregiver at time of event ; Medical neglect; Financial issues; Overwhelmed Caregiver		Abusive head trauma, Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect (medical); Physical abuse	Potentially preventable
NF-135-23-C	Neglect; Drowning/near-drowning	Cognitive disability (child); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Medically fragile child; Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means		Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-138-23-C					
NF-145-23-C	Neglect; Overdose/ingestion	Criminal history (in the home); DCBS history; DCBS issues; Domestic Violence; Environmental neglect; Financial issues; Housing instability; Lack of treatment (mental health or substance abuse); Mental health issues (caregiver); Serial relationships; Substance abuse (in home); Supervisional neglect; Unsafe access to deadly means		Neglect (general - can include leaving child with unsafe caregiver); Neglect due to unsafe access to deadly/potentially deadly means; Supervisory neglect	Apparently accidental; Potentially preventable
NF-146-23-C	Abusive head trauma; Physical abuse	DCBS issues; Commonwealth/County Attorneys; Education/child care issues; Criminal history (in the home); DCBS history; Financial issues; Lack of family support system ; Other; Substance abuse (in home)	Lack of investigation by OIG, Lack of licensed childcare providers for untraditional hours	Abusive head trauma; Physical abuse	Manner undetermined/fo ul play not ruled out